

## Is Panj Pyara Bhai Sahib Singh same as Sukha Singh?

Sir, - Dr. Ernest Trumpp, the German Indologist, was the first Western scholar to translate the *Adi Granth* of the Sikhs into English. This was published in the year 1877 A.D. A copy is available in the National Library, Calcutta. The list of *Panj-Pyaras* given by him in the preface reads as: "Dharam Singh, *Sukha Singh*, Daya Singh, Himmat Singh, and Mukham Singh."

However, in the list of *Panj-Pyaras* conventionally circulated and accepted by the Sikhs, I find that *the name of Sukha Singh has been replaced by Sahib Chand, later called Sahib Singh*, said to hail from Bidar (now in Karnataka state)

Scholars of Sikhism must try to find out as to how the name of Sukha Singh got replaced by Sahib Chand/Sahib Singh. I shall be personally grateful to the scholar who enlightens me in this regard. In case there is an error on the part of Dr. Trumpp, (which I doubt very much, knowing his calibre and the level of erudition) this must be specified to set the record straight.

Also, it may be noted that the correct name of the *Panj-Pyara* hailing from Puri was *Hemanta Roy*, whom the Sikhs started calling Himmat Singh. The correct name will help in tracing the right geneology of his descendants, to establish cordial relationship between the Sikhs and the people of Orissa. **Significantly, the *Panj-Pyaras* came to be selected to represent the five regions of India inhabited by the Sikhs of Guru Nanak.**

**SHER SINGH 'BAINS'**

Flat No. 32, 247/1 Minto Park

Alipore, Kolkata 700 027

Res. Tel. 2223 1026

\* \* \* \* \*

## Dr. Manmohan Singh as India's P.M.: A watershed in Political History

Sir, - Mrs. Sonia Gandhi's role in Indian politics will go down in the history of independent India as a watershed in the sub-continental balance of forces. Her choice of Dr. Manmohan Singh for the driving seat leaves her free to develop a long term strategy to counter the vulgar pulls of Indian orthodoxy and black money, which are gradually spreading in our body politic.

Equally important in this new experiment will be the role of the Leftists, who have never considered India as their nurse and protector, and whose record during the Indian struggle for independence is as limited as that of their *bete noire*, the RSS. Let us bid goodbye to the aberration over the last 30 years, and apply the engine of growth to the primary industries once again.

As for Dr. Singh and the men around him, instead of exploding atom bombs and hunting for lost glory in mythological figures, they should set clear and achievable annual targets in health, education, shelter, power and water supply, and empower the panchayats and local bodies to measure the physical achievements, not money spent, and report to the state governments concerned.

Once the panchayati system is introduced all over the country and emphasis brought back on self reliance, crooks and criminals will no longer be able to fool the administration and the steel frame of governance will recover its dedication and objectivity.

Tokenism will get short shrift in Indian science and our universities will stop being the breeding ground for 'cadres'. I am placing all hope on Sonia to pull the country out of the present quagmire. Let her try to bring back Nehruism in our culture. I wish her all the luck.

**PRONAB K BANERJEE**  
Kolkata (From *The Statesman*)

\* \* \* \* \*

## **National Shame**

Sir, - Dr. Manmohan Singh's government is a national shame. No matter how brilliantly Sonia Gandhi has played her cards she has now exposed her naked misuse of power. A defeated Shivraj Patil has been given a ministry. Then our country has been hijacked by Laloo, Shibu Soren, Md Taslimuddin, JP Yadav. These people are charged-sheeted for loot, murders and other crimes. If Dr. Manmohan Singh was honest and clean then he would have refused to become Prime Minister.

A government cannot be formed with criminals; any decent honest person knows it. What a shame that our Hon Judges of Supreme Court cannot stop this 'rape' of mother India.

Dr. Singh is now a confirmed puppet of Sonia Gandhi. A lion has given up his honourable Pagri for the post. Another bunch of dubious politicians have taken control of our country. Vajpayee and his government kept alive Laloo, Jayalalitha, Mayavati, Sukhram, Bofors and now Dr. Singh will keep the tradition alive. Remember the same Congress was boycotting Fernandes for *Tehelka* issue, corruption? Now the same horrible pathetic Congress have given safe haven to these criminals.

This government cannot last for more than two years. Watch out for Sonia Gandhi as she has learned Indian Politics and will come back to make Rahul or Priyanka as our future rulers. She cannot be trusted. Remember she was the conspirator of Bofors loot and 80 per cent of her ministers are tainted.

Alas, we have lost our values, we have lost our pride, we have become a spineless nation where we choose the goons to rule us and loot. We should wear a black badge everyday, saying this *bhrashtachar* is not accepted by us.

I also request all the IAS officers, IPS officers and the employees of rail and coal ministry to boycott Laloo, Sibiu, and other criminals. They must refuse to work under them. Please wake up citizens, stop these criminals raping our motherland.

**DIPTENDU CHAKRABORTY**  
Toronto (From *The Statesman*)

\* \* \* \* \*

**The Khalsa in turbulent Times**

Sir, - This is with reference to Sr. R.S. Vidyarthi's article: ' *The Khalsa in Turbulent Times* ' (TSR: April issue)

By and large, the piece is evocative. However, the death of Maharaja Ranjit Singh's four sons under the arcway has been mixed up by the author with the death of his grandson, Prince Naunihal Singh. Even Maharaja's own demise, as reported, is not correct. I am, therefore sending him an excerpt of about 30 pages from Sita Ram Kohli's ' *Sunset of Sikh Empire* ', covering the life story and tragic death of Prince Naunihal Singh. Also, I'm sending him a copy of my ' *Anglo - Sikh Wars* ' for general reading.

I shall be grateful if Sr. Vidyarthi could send me a copy of Sir Mohd Iqbal's Persian Poem containing the line " *Khalsa shamsheer - o - Qura ' an ra burad* " as quoted in the article, for, I am a graduate in Persian and as such, much interested in this poem.

**KARNAIL SINGH**

Canada

Email: karnailsingh2@rogers.com

\* \* \* \* \*

## **Core Sikhism is Indivisible**

This refers to the article 'Universality of the Sikh Philosophy: An Analysis' by Sukhraj Singh Dhillon (TSR: May 2004). While the article makes a fairly good analysis, there is a need to enlarge upon the two points suggested by the writer. Towards the conclusion, the writer discusses Khalsa and *khande di Pahul*. Differentiating between a Khalsa and a Sikh, he suggests that both need to respect each other as equal Sikhs.

From my experience of my Sikh brethren in Canada, the USA, the UK and Australia, there is broadly no issue between a Khalsa and a Sikh; the issue is with the *non-Keshadharis* (and others) who stress that hair is not a necessity. I am not presenting these remarks as conclusive, rather there is need to further discuss what are the 'sub' and 'sub-sub' sections of the Sikhs when Dhillon projects the difference between a Khalsa and a Sikh?

Secondly, the writer has raised the issue of *sangat* on chairs. People who are "pro-chair" often come up with flawed explanation that "there were no chairs during the life time of our Gurus." Let me stress: during the times of Gurus there were no computers, PDAs and CD players. Nor these gadgets were available during the time of Dharmik Salahakar Committee in 1935. Those who plead for installing Sri Guru Granth Sahib at a higher place, why can't they have a Sikh Centre, on the pattern of the classroom of Western universities? Then everybody would be seated on chairs. *Gurbani* files would be available on the computer projected on a screen. *Sangat* would have all the *Gurbani* on PDAs instead of traditional *Gutkas*, and instead of having *Ragis*, top Kirtan CDs can be used. After all, there is a need to discuss *Gurbani*. Just by bowing to Guru Granth Sahib one is not absolved of the responsibility of reading and understanding *Gurbani*. The message of Guru Nanak Dev Ji is very clear:

“As long as we are in this world, O Nanak, we should listen to, and speak of the Lord.”

Why do these modern “chair-sitters” run away from the responsibility of a discussion based congregation? In all honesty, chairs have been introduced for personal convenience, not for the propagation of Sikhism. I suppose no one will oppose such a Study Centre as mentioned above, if that is made into a reality in future.

**GURTEJ SINGH**  
Wellington-New Zealand  
Email: gurtej@paradise.net.nz

## **Patiala’s Gurmat College in Doldrums**

Sir, - The Gurmat College, Patiala, established in 1968 and affiliated to Punjabi University, has lately been in doldrums. Guru Nanak Foundation, New Delhi, has been running the college.

During the month of February, I happened to visit the College and address the students “Science and Spirituality” in an interactive session. Most of the students are, of course *amritdhari*, and participate in Gurdwara sessions, as part of the curriculum, both in the morning and evening.

Guru Nanak Foundation has been running a public school on the college campus, earning huge profits. But it has failed to invest any funds in the college. To my utter surprise, the post of Principal has been lying vacant for over two years. At present, there is only one lecturer who is teaching both the M.A. classes and acting as Principal.

I wonder why Guru Nanak Foundation has such a callous attitude towards the Gurmat College, the only institution of its kind in India! The college has produced a galaxy of brilliant students who occupy Chairs in Sikh Studies in India and America. I appeal to SGPC/ DGPC and other Sikh organizations to intervene and take control of the college to put it on rails. What is the use of celebrating anniversaries if we cannot run the Gurmat College, which is one of the premier institutions of the Sikhs in India.

**H.S.VIRK**  
360, Sector 71  
SAS Nagar 160071 (Punjab)

\* \* \* \* \*

## **Urgency of Awareness**

Sir, - The June issue highlighted human Rights. The Sikh International Rescue & Relief Council” (see address below) have done a lot of work in the last decade. The nature of our activities is quite apparent from the title. We are a group of genuine workers who have had the chance to take up the services towards promoting the Sikh Cause. Our people especially youth have made many sacrifices towards the Panth. But the benefit has been mostly “encashed” by the so called Panthic leaders. There is no gainsaying the fact that the Sikh politicians have the poorest record of *nishkam seva* because of their eagerness to grab political power at any cost without

caring for the problems faced by the masses. While they were in power, or otherwise, they have always turned a deaf ear towards youth and victims. Unfortunately, at the time of Election, the Sikh youth were compelled to choose the Lesser Evil. That way these shrewd people always escaped from any damage to their "Personality Cult."

Even under adverse circumstances our Organisation did not cease to work. In whatever way it was possible we continued our efforts towards the cause of Sikh Panth. In this process, we were lucky enough to receive the attention of these earnest and fully awakened gentlemen who came to our rescue and helped us morally and financially: in particular:

S. Bhagwant Singh Dalawri (Tapovan), S. Saroop Singh Narang, Gurjit Singh, Gurbachan Singh (Middlesex) and Avtar Singh (Leicester) of UK, and Amrik Singh of California.

In addition to these donors we had moral support of Retired Chief Justice R.S. Narula, S. Saran Singh, editor of *Sikh Review*, Sr. Lawyer H.S. Phoolka, (Late) H.S. Siyali Advocate, Advocate S. Bhagwant Sigh Siyalka, S. Daljit Singh of New Zealand and other like-minded eminent persons.

We have an ambitious programme with regard to the count down of our activities in the last decade. At this occasion we are going to contact all our well wishers and donors who have a soft corner for the Sikh Panth with a view to help us financially so that the selfless band of our sincere workers be honoured for their noble deeds. Earlier, we wanted to commemorate the Death Anniversary of Late H.S. Siyali, Advocate, but It has been decided now to hold a bigger function of the organization where all the eminent persons (living or dead) who had helped us in whatever way it was possible be honoured at the function to be held in the near future.

All contribution through bank draft cheque or otherwise may be sent to convener S. Oken Singh "The Sikh International Rescue & Relief Council".

**OKEN SINGH**

Aulakh Nursing Home

Amritsar 143001

Email: okensingh2002@yahoo.com

\* \* \* \* \*

## **Perversion on TV**

In *The Sikh Review* of February 2004, (page 78), under 'Perversion on T.V.', a note is appended saying: 'An Online petition could be started - for example, let's all join hands - let's all speak with one voice.' I fully support the concern expressed therein and shall like to act upon this proposal. I would implore to be enlightened how to go about this, i.e. how to join hands and start online petition campaign. However, it is unclear who wrote this piece. I shall like to be connected for further common action. Kindly convey this anxiety to appropriate person/s.

**J.S.SETHI**

Email: army\_joginder@hotmail.com

**(Mr. Sarabjeet Singh Baweja had written the letter. His Email id is: rajasagars@yahoo.com)**

\* \* \* \* \*

## **Why Birth Anniversaries?**

Sir - My thanks to Dr. Harjinder Singh for his article published in ***The Sikh Review*** - May 2004. My personal view is that Sikhs should not celebrate "*Birth Anniversaries/Centenaries*", but the Gurugaddi Divas when Guru Sahib took over the mantle of Guruship. The trend started in 1999, or perhaps in 1966 and 1969.

**GURMIT SINGH**

Email: GurmitSingh@bigpond.com